

## Covid – 19 update coronavirus

### Force majeure, *imprévision*/hardship and emergency legislation on contracts under French law in light of the Covid-19 pandemic

The Covid-19 pandemic and its consequences are having a major and sudden impact on economic activities and in particular the conditions in which contracts are being performed. A multitude of *scenarii* can be envisaged, such as supply shortage, ill or confined employees, governmental measures adopted in response to the pandemic..., which may affect the performance of ongoing contracts and lead to a potential breach of contractual obligations or make such performance excessively onerous.

Whether a party to a French law governed contract may be exempt from performing its contractual obligations and/or from incurring contractual liability in light of the Covid-19

pandemic will depend on whether it can rely on force majeure. Likewise, the question whether ongoing contracts will have to be adapted to the change of economic circumstances resulting from the current health crisis will depend on the possibility to rely on *imprévision*/hardship.

This publication addresses the applicable rules on force majeure and *imprévision*/hardship under French law and the possibility for the parties to derogate from those rules in their contract. It also presents the newly introduced exceptional rules adopted by the French Government in the context of the state of emergency recently declared in France. It ends with a focus on the steps you could consider taking to better protect your business in its current and future contractual dealings.

#### YOUR CONTACTS



**Erwan Poisson**

Partner - Paris

Tel +33 1 4006 5387

[erwan.poisson@allenoverly.com](mailto:erwan.poisson@allenoverly.com)



**Julie Metois**

Associate - Paris

Tel +33 1 4006 5324

[julie.metois@allenoverly.com](mailto:julie.metois@allenoverly.com)



**Geoffroy Pascaud**

Associate - Paris

Tel +33 1 4006 5307

[geoffroy.pascaud@allenoverly.com](mailto:geoffroy.pascaud@allenoverly.com)



**Quentin Mautray**

Associate - Paris

Tel +33 1 4006 5052

[quentin.mautray@allenoverly.com](mailto:quentin.mautray@allenoverly.com)



**Gaspard Neuhoff**

Associate - Paris

Tel +33 1 4006 5135

[gaspard.neuhoff@allenoverly.com](mailto:gaspard.neuhoff@allenoverly.com)

## Force majeure

**Force majeure is a statutory exemption clause found in Article 1218 of the French Civil Code, which automatically applies to French law governed contracts, even absent any force majeure clause.**

### The conditions of force majeure under the statutory regime

No event is, in itself, a force majeure event. An event will qualify as force majeure only if it meets cumulatively all the following conditions:

- The event must be beyond the control of the non-performing party;
- The event could not be reasonably foreseeable at the time of entering into the contract; and
- The defaulting party may not avoid the effects of this event with appropriate measures and is therefore prevented from performing its contractual obligations. This means that the event must be irresistible with respect to both its occurrence (the event must be inevitable for the non-performing party) and its effects (the consequences of the event are insurmountable for the defaulting party, who is unable to take the appropriate measures to circumvent them) with the consequence that it is impossible for a party to perform its contractual obligations.

This impediment must be absolute. There will be no force majeure where it is still materially possible for a party to perform its contractual obligations even if such performance has become significantly more difficult or more onerous.

It is in principle impossible to invoke force majeure in relation to an obligation to deliver a fungible good that has perished or has been destroyed: the performance of such obligation is not considered impossible because a fungible good (such as crude oil, corn, precious metals, etc.) can always be substituted by another of the same type.

The same applies to monetary obligations. The French Supreme Court for civil and commercial matters (*Cour de cassation*) considers that a defaulting party may not rely on force majeure to be exempt from a contractual obligation to pay sum of money.

State measures may constitute a force majeure event if they meet the above-mentioned conditions. However, the mere fact that public authorities assign a specific status to an event (such as declarations of the World Health Organization qualifying the spread of Covid-19 as a pandemic), though it may give a strong indication as to the gravity of such event, does not bind the Courts when assessing whether it qualifies as force majeure.

French Courts have a wide margin of appreciation in this area and their assessment of force majeure is very much case-based. A party will therefore be able to rely on force majeure in light of the Covid-19 pandemic and its consequences only if it is able to justify that all the foregoing conditions are met, which will depend on the specific circumstances of each individual case.

As of today, a number of decisions have already been rendered by French Courts in relation to the Covid-19 pandemic and force majeure, although these decisions were not rendered in contractual matters. In one series of decisions, the Courts held that the circumstance that a party could not appear in person at the hearing before the Court due to his potential contamination by the virus or due to the current measures restricting the activities of Courts constituted a case of force majeure. In another series of decisions, the Courts upheld the prorogation of administrative custodies for foreigners whose transfers to other countries were suspended due to the Covid-19 pandemic. It remains to be seen in which circumstances French Courts will uphold force majeure in contractual cases.

## The consequences of force majeure under the statutory regime

The consequences of force majeure (set out in Articles 1218, 1231-1, 1351 and 1351-1 of the French Civil Code) will depend on whether the impediment to perform the contractual obligation is temporary or definitive:

- If the impediment to perform is only temporary, performance of the contractual obligation is suspended and the defaulting party is not contractually liable for the non-performance or late performance of its obligation. Force majeure exempts the defaulting party of its obligation and contractual liability only for the time during which performance is impossible. However, as soon as the impediment ceases, the defaulting party must resume the performance of its obligation.

By way of exception, a temporary impediment to perform the obligation will result in the termination of the contract rather than its mere suspension, when no delay in the performance of the obligation is in fact practicable. This would be the case when performance of the obligation within the deadline initially agreed is essential to the proper performance of the contractual operation as a whole and when even a slight non-performance or delay in performance would no longer allow the contract to survive as a whole.

- If the impossibility to perform the obligation is permanent, the defaulting party is in principle definitively released from its obligation and exempt from contractual liability. By way of exception, the defaulting party will still be contractually liable for non-performance if (i) it has contractually undertaken to assume the consequences of force majeure, or (ii) prior to the occurrence of the force majeure event, it has been served a formal notice by the non-defaulting party to perform its obligation.

In addition, the contract is automatically terminated. Termination may lead to reciprocal restitutions between the parties, depending on the nature of the contract at issue (French Civil Code, Article 1229). Therefore, as a result of

termination, the non-defaulting party will also be discharged of its own obligations for the future and may, in certain cases, obtain restitution for past performance of its obligations.

## What if the contract contains a force majeure clause?

The statutory regime of force majeure is not mandatory law, nor a matter of public policy under French law. The parties may therefore stipulate in their contract a clause that derogates (completely or only partially) from the statutory regime. The statutory force majeure provision will in principle not take precedence over any contractual arrangements.

The parties may insert in their contract a clause having the effect of reducing or extending the scope of circumstances that fall within force majeure:

- The contract may provide a clause that rules out the application of force majeure and puts on the defaulting party the burden of any non-performance due to a force majeure event. Such clause must however be expressly and specifically provided in the contract to be valid.
- The clause may modify the definition of a force majeure event, by providing that an event may produce the exonerating effects of force majeure, even though it does not present the conditions normally required under the statutory regime to qualify as such.
- The clause may list the events which the parties deem constitute or not constitute a force majeure event. This list may be exhaustive, non-exhaustive, conclusive or merely exemplary.

The parties may adapt the effects of force majeure by providing, for example, that should a force majeure event continue for longer than a specific period of time, the parties shall engage in negotiations to adopt adequate measures in light of the circumstances, or that the non-defaulting party shall be entitled to terminate the contract. The clause may also identify the obligations in the contract for which force majeure may or may not be invoked (by providing, for example, that force majeure shall not be relied upon in relation to obligations to

make payments fallen due or to provide security for payment).

A force majeure clause may also provide specific procedural conditions that the party intending to

rely on such clause must necessarily fulfil within a given deadline, such as prior notification by the defaulting party to the non-defaulting party of the occurrence of a force majeure event.

## Imprévision/Hardship

**An external event affecting the performance of the contract may not necessarily be qualified as force majeure. In this case, it may still be possible to rely on the mechanism of *imprévision* or trigger a hardship clause if the parties have inserted such a clause in their contract. This will be the case, in particular, when the Covid-19 pandemic does not make it completely impossible for a party to perform its contractual obligations (thus excluding force majeure), but makes such performance excessively onerous.**

### The conditions of *imprévision*

The mechanism of *imprévision* found in Article 1195 of the French Civil Code provides for the renegotiation of the contract when an unforeseeable change of circumstances makes the performance of the contract excessively onerous for a party.

*Imprévision* was recently incorporated in French law with the reform of contract law adopted by Ordinance No. 2016-131 of 10 February 2016. Therefore, the regime of *imprévision* only applies to contracts concluded as from 1 October 2016.

The cumulative conditions of *imprévision* are as follows: (i) a change of circumstances that was unforeseeable at the time the contract was entered into (ii) makes the performance of the contract excessively onerous for a party, (iii) who did not contractually accept to bear the risks of such change of circumstances. In addition, *imprévision* may not be relied upon in relation to obligations resulting from operations on financial bonds or contracts listed in paragraphs I to III of Article L. 211-1 of the French Monetary and Financial Code.

### The consequences of *imprévision*

If these conditions are met, the party invoking *imprévision* may request its contractual partner to renegotiate the contract. The requesting party must however continue to perform the contract during the renegotiation. If such renegotiation fails or if the requested party refuses to renegotiate, the parties may agree to terminate the contract or jointly ask the Courts to adapt the contract. Absent such agreement between the parties, the Courts may, upon either party's request, revise the contract or terminate it.

### Hardship clauses

*Imprévision* may not be applicable, either because its conditions are not met or because the contract was entered into before 1 October 2016. However, the regime of *imprévision* is not mandatory law and the parties may contractually agree to derogate from it through a hardship clause. If the parties have stipulated in their contract a hardship clause, the latter will apply regardless of whether *imprévision* is available (and irrespective of when the contract was concluded).

The parties may stipulate a hardship clause in their contract providing for the revision of the contract in case of a change of economic circumstances. In that clause, the parties can set out the characteristics of the economic circumstances that may lead to a revision of the contract, as well as the terms of such revision (which could be left to a third-party expert or the Courts absent an agreement between the parties).

# Exceptional rules resulting from the state of health emergency

**Pursuant to Law n°2020-290 of 23 March 2020, the French Parliament declared a two-month state of health emergency in light of the Covid-19 pandemic.**

Following this Law, the French Government adopted Ordinance n°2020-306 on 25 March 2020, recently amended by Ordinance n°2020-427 of 15 April 2020, which contain a series of provisions affecting contracts:<sup>1</sup>

- With respect to contractual obligations that must be performed within a defined deadline, which expires between 12 March 2020 and 24 June 2020, payments ordered by way of penalty (*astreintes*), as well as contractual penalty clauses, termination clauses and forfeiture clauses (such as acceleration clauses) that purport to sanction the non-performance of such obligations within that deadline are paralysed. The date on which such *astreinte* and clauses can start to produce their effects shall be postponed until the end of a period running after 24 June 2020, which period is equal to the time elapsed between (i) on the one hand, 12 March 2020 or the date on which the litigious obligation was created, whichever is the latest, and (ii) on the other hand, the date on which this obligation should have normally been performed. The effects of such *astreintes* and contractual clauses will begin after that period of postponement only, subject to the condition that the defaulting party still has not performed its obligation by then.
- With respect to contractual obligations, other than obligations to pay a sum of money, that must be performed within a defined deadline, which expires after 24 June 2020, the date on which *astreintes*, as well as contractual penalty clauses, termination clauses and forfeiture clauses that purport to sanction the non-performance of such obligations within that deadline can start producing their effects is postponed as from the date on which they should have normally started to produce their effects pursuant to the contract, until the end of a period equal to the time elapsed between (i) on the one hand, 12 March 2020 or the date on which the litigious obligation was created, whichever is the latest, and (ii) on the other hand, 24 June 2020. Contractual obligations to pay a sum of money are not covered by this rule.
- *Astreintes* and penalty clauses that started producing their effects before 12 March 2020 are suspended between 12 March 2020 and 24 June 2020.
- When a contract can only be terminated within a specific period of time or when a contract is automatically renewed absent a formal termination within a specific deadline, and such period of time or deadline expires between 12 March 2020 and 24 June 2020, this period of time or deadline is extended by an additional two months after 24 June 2020.

These provisions are not applicable to a limited number of specific obligations imposed by French Monetary and Financial Code, the French Insurance Code and the French Commercial Code.

<sup>1</sup> Please note that the following dates are calculated by reference to the duration of the current state of health emergency which, as of today, is expected to last until 24 May 2020. These dates are susceptible to be extended should the French Parliament decide to prolong the state of health emergency after 24 May 2020, or reduced if the French Government decides to terminate the state of health emergency before that date.

Please also note that the date of 24 June 2020 mentioned in the following paragraphs is, as of today, not entirely certain, as a recent interpretative note of the Ministry of Justice may imply that such date could be 23 June 2020 instead. This question remains to be clarified. In the meantime, this ePublication takes a conservative approach and retains the date of 24 June 2020.

The parties are free to exclude the application of these rules by express clauses. Absent such exclusion, they may also decide to waive their right to invoke the protection offered by these rules, provided that such waiver is unequivocal. However, even in this case, it cannot be excluded that French courts may, in light of the exceptional current circumstances, decide to mitigate the effects of certain contractual clauses that purport to sanction the non-performance of obligations. For example, under French law courts have the prerogative to reduce the amount of damages stipulated in penalty clauses, should they consider that the stipulated damages are manifestly excessive. French courts also have the possibility to refuse enforcement of termination clauses when they consider that they were triggered with bad faith (which could be the case if the defaulting party had legitimate difficulties to perform the contract due to the Covid-19 pandemic).

These rules apply to all contracts, regardless of when they were concluded (i.e. before or after these rules entered into force).

## What's next?

With respect to your ongoing contracts as well as contracts which you intend to enter into in a near future, it is necessary to investigate whether they contain obligations which must be performed within a deadline falling between 12 March and 24 June 2020 or after that date. In both cases, you or your contracting party will be unable to immediately enforce *astreintes*, penalty clauses, termination clauses and forfeiture clauses that purport to sanction the non-performance of such obligations. The regime applicable to the postponement of the effects of such *astreintes* or clauses will however vary, depending whether the deadline for performing the obligation falls between 12 March and 24 June 2020 or after 24 June 2020 and whether the obligation is one to pay a sum of money.

Moreover, you will have to verify whether *astreintes* or penalty clauses started to run

These rules apply to French law governed contracts. Moreover, according to an interpretative note issued by the French Ministry of Justice, the rules described above with respect to *astreintes*, as well as contractual penalty clauses, termination clauses and forfeiture clauses, constitute overriding mandatory provisions that French Courts (should they have jurisdiction) would apply irrespective of the foreign law otherwise applicable to the contract. However, this is subject to confirmation by French Courts in future case law and this question will remain unclear until it is finally clarified by the Courts.

Please note that these rules are recent and were designed as an urgent response to the current health emergency. They have already been subject to amendments and it cannot be excluded that they may be modified further. Moreover, it is yet to be seen how French Courts will interpret and apply them in practice.

before 12 March 2020 in relation to any of your contracts. If so, note that they are now currently suspended until 24 June 2020.

Regarding the termination or automatic renewal of your contracts, note that the period for terminating or for opposing such renewal has been extended for an additional two months after 24 June 2020, if such termination or opposition had to occur between 12 March and 24 June 2020.

With respect to your current contracts, which you suspect could be affected by the Covid-19 pandemic, it is highly recommended to examine whether they contain force majeure and/or hardship clauses and, in the affirmative, whether those clauses may cover the consequences resulting from the Covid-19 pandemic on the performance of the contracts. If so, these clauses will have to be attentively reviewed to

ascertain what their effects are on your contracts (suspension of the contract, renegotiation, termination, etc.) and whether you or your contracting parties may need to fulfill procedural conditions, such as notifications, within a specific deadline to trigger the clause.

Absent any such clause, should you or your contractual partners find it impossible or excessively onerous to perform the contracts due to Covid-19, it will be necessary to verify whether the conditions of force majeure or *imprévision* under the statutory regimes are met.

Of course, in any event the parties are free to engage in discussions and agree on adapting, even temporarily, their contractual relationship for the period of disruption caused by the Covid-19 pandemic. Entering in negotiations early on in the current crisis may indeed achieve a better outcome for both parties in the long term, depending on the content and purpose of your agreement.

Also, we recommend to document the way in which your obligations are affected by Covid-19,

and the measures you are taking to try to limit its adverse consequences. If you are at risk of defaulting on a contractual obligation, it is generally recommended to notify your contracting party immediately of the force majeure event that is preventing you from assuring contractual performance. The contemporaneous documentation of the real impact and mitigation measures are often key in a subsequent dispute to help courts or arbitrators to determine liability and, even more so, compensation.

For future contracts, it may be necessary to adapt wording that you usually incorporate in your agreements and to contemplate inserting/modifying force majeure and/or hardship clauses, depending on whether and how your business may be affected by the current circumstances and their potential evolution.

Should you like to discuss in more detail the content of our ePublication or need any additional information, do not hesitate to contact us.

Allen & Overy means Allen & Overy LLP and/or its affiliated undertakings. Allen & Overy LLP is a limited liability partnership registered in England and Wales with registered number OC306763. Allen & Overy (Holdings) Limited is a limited company registered in England and Wales with registered number 07462870. Allen & Overy LLP and Allen & Overy (Holdings) Limited are authorised and regulated by the Solicitors Regulation Authority of England and Wales.

The term partner is used to refer to a member of Allen & Overy LLP or a director of Allen & Overy (Holdings) Limited or, in either case, an employee or consultant with equivalent standing and qualifications or an individual with equivalent status in one of Allen & Overy LLP's affiliated undertakings. A list of the members of Allen & Overy LLP and of the non-members who are designated as partners, and a list of the directors of Allen & Overy (Holdings) Limited, is open to inspection at our registered office at One Bishops Square, London E1 6AD.

© Allen & Overy LLP 2020. This document is for general guidance only and does not constitute definitive advice. | EUP1: 2001276909.1